

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board (HPARB) of the Village of Cooperstown was held in the Village Office Building, 22 Main Street, Cooperstown, New York on Tuesday, September 13, 2016. Members in attendance were Chair – Liz Callahan, Brian Alexander, David Sanford, Roger MacMillan and Mark Mershon. Eight members of the public were present.

Ms. Callahan called the meeting to order at 5:00 PM.

Regular Agenda

40-44 Chestnut Street (Melissa Marietta) – install Little Free Library structure

Mr. Alexander asked how the Little Free Libraries are managed or regulated. Mrs. Marietta explained that it is completely up to the stewards to manage and maintain them. She added that the Library Board voted to unanimously support their Little Free Library efforts.

Mr. Alexander noted the Village's fence 4 foot height limitation.

Members of HPARB debated about whether the Little Free Libraries fall under the items that don't need HPARB approval. Mr. Sanford added that he feels it depends on the size of the structure not just the height.

Dr. MacMillan confirmed that it was endorsed by the library and reiterated a concern about how it will be maintained.

Mr. Alexander said that as long as it is no higher than 4' it is really no different than a birdbath or other lawn ornament. He said it is easily reversible and in his understanding it doesn't need HPARB approval. He said his biggest concern has always been related to how it will be regulated.

Dr. MacMillan disagreed that it doesn't need HPARB approval and read from the zoning law to support HPARB's role in regulation.

Mr. Sanford made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed installation of a Little Free Library at 40-44 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work will not alter the original features or structure;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (3)(a), (3)(b), and (3)(d);*
- *In addition the following conditions must be met:*
 - *the Little Free Library must be stably mounted to a base that is securely affixed in the ground;*
 - *the Little Free Library structure be no larger than 24" h x 24" w x 24" d;*

- o *the total combined height of the installed structure and the base must be at or below the 4' fence limitation.*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 40-44 Chestnut Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 40-44 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Merson seconded the motion. Dr. MacMillan noted that if someone wants to put one up he has grave concerns of what goes into the Little Free Library. A vote on the motion had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

21 Delaware Street (David Wood) – enclose back porch

Ms. Callahan reviewed the drawings and material list provided, and confirmed that the materials will match existing.

Mr. Wood noted that the change is not visible from the street.

Dr. MacMillan made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed enclosure of the back porch at 21 Delaware Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), (3)(c), and (5);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 21 Delaware Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 21 Delaware Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

1 Westridge Road (Craig Phillips for Carol Taylor) – install covered porch on front of house

Mr. Phillips explained that the owner is applying for the addition of a 5' x 10' front porch to shed water and allow for sitting.

The porch will have an iron hand railing, existing stone stoop will be left in place under new porch structure.

Mr. Alexander made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed addition of a 5' x 10' front porch at 1 Westridge Road, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is not listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), and (3)(c);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 1 Westridge Road;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 1 Westridge Road, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Dr. MacMillan seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

41 Lake Street (Gary Glynn for Beth Owen Wade) – installation of 4' fence on rear of property

Mr. Glynn explained that they would like to install a dog fence on the rear of the property, materials to match the existing fence on the front of the property.

Mr. Mershon made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed 4' fence on the rear property at 41 Lake Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), and (3)(c);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 41 Lake Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 41 Lake Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

3 Walnut Street (Walter (Jim) Hogan) – porch railing replacement

Mr. Hogan explained that the existing railing is beginning to rot, and he is proposing to replace with an aluminum railing, painted black. He provided photos to augment the material information in the application.

Mr. Sanford made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed replacement of a wood porch railing with an aluminum railing, painted black at 3 Walnut Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as non-contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), and (3)(b);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 3 Walnut Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 3 Walnut Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

91 Chestnut Street (Kevin Yerdon) – replace back roof (rolled roof) with architectural asphalt shingles

Mr. Yerdon explained that he is confident that, as pitch is now, the asphalt architectural shingles will work as an ice and water membrane will be installed under the shingles.

He noted that there is the possibility of deciding to slightly change the pitch of the roof for structural integrity. This would be determined after existing roof material is stripped.

As presented, and because this section of roof is not visible from the street, there were no concerns among the HPARB members.

Dr. MacMillan made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: September 13, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed replacement of rolled roofing on back roof with asphalt architectural shingles at 91 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), and (3)(c);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 91 Chestnut Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 13th day of September, 2016, determine that the work at 91 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Mershon seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

It was noted that once the materials are removed and conditions assessed, supporting roof structure and pitch may change slightly if necessary.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

Proposed CVS, Chestnut and Beaver Street (Todd Hamula, representative for CVS) –
former Cooperstown Motel location

Todd Hamula noted in his presentation that the current structure is 28,000 square feet and a two story building. He stated that the proposed square footage of the CVS building is 9,500 square feet.

He stated that the front of the building and its entrance is oriented to Chestnut Street.

Mr. Hamula said that the traffic study is being finalized.

He introduced a photo collage of local architecture and a photo collage of buildings surrounding the proposed CVS site for context.

A presentation was also made by Anthony Germanese, architect with Norr (Albany), a firm working with Mr. Hamula and CVS.

He provided information regarding the West elevation, showing a Mansard roof, pediment would have depth, a little more prominent gable roof, windows have exterior and interior shutters and the siding is James Hardy, color autumn tan.

Mr. Hamula noted that the brick base ties the building back to Price Chopper is durable and weathers well. He stated that the Mansard Roof hides the HVAC equipment.

He noted that the signage is only being presented for placement and not approval.

He noted that the reason for darker colors over lighter colors is that there are a lot of contrasting colors in town.

Mr. Alexander asked to see Mr. Hamula's photo collage of residences and asked about the effort to make CVS fit in with the residences.

Mr. Hamula explained that it makes sense that it be an extension of the residential neighborhood and be in harmony with it.

He stated that the current height is 25 feet, and the proposed building would be a little taller than the Price Chopper because the site is elevated.

He said that the dumpster enclosure will match the building.

Dr. MacMillan asked that the internal shutters be explained.

Mr. Germanese explained the role of the internal shutters in the retail space and the exterior shutters have the appearance of a shutter but are not functional.

Mr. Hamula added that the exterior shutters are not functional, their appearance helps to bring the architectural style.

Ms. Callahan expressed concerned about the "commercial" look of the mansard roof; the proportions of the pediments and the number of pediments; the use of brick; and the proliferation of posts/pillars.

Mr. Alexander added that he agreed with the concern about the roof, but he is not concerned about the shutters.

Discussion of the reasons brick was used continued. Mr. Sanford suggested that Mr. Hamula and Mr. Germanese look at the material used between the ground and the clapboards at the Thanksgiving Home. Ms. Callahan suggested they also look at the foundation-level material used at the house under rehabilitation at the corner of Maple and Grove Streets.

Mr. Hamula noted examples of mansard roofs in the community. Ms. Callahan noted that there are not many mansard roofs and they are not common to architectural styles in the village.

Mr. Hamula explained that a mansard/hipped roof becomes a necessity when trying to limit the height due to the size of the building.

Mr. Germanese was asked to revisit the use of brick, address the concern that there are too many columns, and change the proportions of the pediments.

Mr. Hamula asked if local commercial buildings with long facades of nothing on them bother anyone.

Mr. Germanese noted that he will try to rethink mansard roof, tighten up pediment, do away with some pillars and brick, trim corners, find a way to address drive through in a more traditional way.

Trolley Shelters – Information regarding placement of trolley shelters at the red and yellow lot, similar to the one at the blue lot was provided by Dr. Falk.

Dr. MacMillan made a motion to approve the shelters as presented. Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, MacMillan, Sanford, Alexander, Mershon. Motion carried.

Minutes – Dr. MacMillan made a motion to approve the minutes of the August 23, 2016 HPARB meeting as submitted. Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, MacMillan, Sanford, Mershon, Alexander Motion carried.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Liz Callahan, Chair, HPARB
Village of Cooperstown